Exhibit 4

		Page 1
1		
2	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
3	FOR THE DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA COLUMBIA DIVISION	
	x	
4	THE SOUTH CAROLINA STATE CONFERENCE OF THE NAACP	
5	and	
6		
7	TAIWAN SCOTT, ON BEHALF OF HIMSELF Case No. AND ALL OTHER SIMILARLY SITUATED 3:21-CV-03302	
,	PERSONS, JMC-TJH-RMG	
8		
	Plaintiffs,	
9		
1.0	Vs.	
10	THOMAS C. ALEXANDER, IN HIS OFFICIAL	
11	CAPACITY AS PRESIDENT OF THE SENATE;	
	LUKE A. RANKIN, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY	
12	AS CHAIRMAN OF THE SENATE JUDICIARY	
	COMMITTEE; MURRELL SMITH, IN HIS OFFICIAL	
13	CAPACITY AS SPEAKER OF THE HOUSE OF	
1.4	REPRESENTATIVES; CHRIS MURPHY, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS CHAIRMAN OF THE	
14	HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES JUDICIARY	
15	COMMITTEE; WALLACE H. JORDAN, IN HIS	
	OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS CHAIRMAN OF THE HOUSE	
16	OF REPRESENTATIVES ELECTIONS LAW	
	SUBCOMMITTEE; HOWARD KNAPP, IN HIS	
17	OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS INTERIM EXECUTIVE	
18	DIRECTOR OF THE SOUTH CAROLINA STATE	
10	ELECTION COMMISSION; JOHN WELLS, JOANNE DAY, CLIFFORD J. EDLER, LINDA MCCALL,	
19	AND SCOTT MOSELEY, IN THEIR OFFICIAL	
	CAPACITIES AS MEMBERS OF THE SOUTH	
20	CAROLINA STATE ELECTION COMMISSION,	
21	Defendants.	
00	x	
22	STENOGRAPHIC REMOTE VIRTUAL DEPOSITION	
23	CHARLES TERRENI	
	Tuesday, August 16, 2022	
24		
25		

Page 56 1 TERRENI 2 Α. Well, yeah. I mean there 3 were some lawyers I'm sure that 4 communicated with the community and 5 with me. Dale Oldham was one of 6 them. I'm trying to think if there 7 was anybody else. That was it I 8 believe. 9 Ο. Who does Dale Oldham work 10 for? 11 That's a good question. Ι 12 don't know. 13 Q. Did you communicate with 14 him? 15 Yeah. Α. How often? 16 0. 17 Rarely. He called me after Α. 18 his staff plan was released one or 19 two times and I'm talking about 20 communicating with him about 21 congressional redistricting. 22 Q. Did you talk to him about 23 noncongressional redistricting? 24 Yeah. Α. 25 Such as? Q.

Page 57 1 TERRENI 2 I didn't talk to Α. A boat. 3 him very often but I have known Dale for a long time. I'm sure he wished 4 5 me a Merry Christmas and that kind 6 of thing. 7 Q. How long have you known 8 him? 9 30 years. 10 And you don't know -- I'm Q. 11 sorry, do you know who he works for? 12 Α. I do not. I know he works 13 for some national Republican 14 organization. The National 15 Republican Redistricting Trust has 16 been mentioned in the discovery that 17 I have seen. I don't know if he works with them or not. I have no 18 19 idea. So you talked to him one or 20 21 two times after the staff plan 22 released and we earlier discussed 23 that that was around November of 24 2021. Is that when you recall 25 talking to him?

	Page 58
1	TERRENI
2	A. I think so, yes.
3	Q. And only those one or two
4	times?
5	A. Again, if we are talking
6	about congressional, yes. Only
7	those one or two. It was a couple
8	of calls.
9	Q. Who else was on those
10	calls?
11	A. No one.
12	Q. How long did they last?
13	A. Couple minutes.
14	Q. Did you correspond by
15	email, text or some other means
16	after or around those conversations?
17	A. He sent me a couple of text
18	messages.
19	Q. Did you turn those over in
20	discovery in this case?
21	A. Yes.
22	Q. Do you know more than
23	five texts messages, around how
24	many?
25	A. I think it was just two or

Page 59 1 TERRENI 2 three. 3 What was the nature of Ο. those texts? 4 5 As I recall, he texted us 6 something to the effect of having a 7 plan that he thought, just having a 8 plan that he wanted us to see. 9 There was a second text, if I 10 recall, just from the exhibits you 11 shared that -- says something about 12 he had some political data that was 13 different from the data we had 14 posted our website. Those were the 15 texts. 16 Is your position that he 17 reached out to you initially or did 18 you reach out to him regarding 19 congressional maps? 20 He reached out to me. Α. 21 Ο. And is it your position 22 that he does not work for the South 23 Carolina Senate this congressional 24 cycle? 25 Α. My position? I'm not aware

Page 60 1 TERRENI 2 that he works for the -- whoa, whoa, 3 whoa. I'm not aware that he worked for the -- that's right, I'm not 4 5 aware that he worked for the South 6 Carolina Senate during this 7 congressional cycle. If you want me to expand, I am 8 9 aware that he did some work on a 10 Senate Republican caucus during the 11 Senate phase of redistricting, just 12 to be clear. 13 Now, you said he wanted us Q. 14 to see our maps, some maps on that. 15 Who was us that you are referring 16 to? 17 Α. Senate -- Senate Judiciary staff. 18 19 And did he ultimately send Q. 20 you that information? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. And he sent that to you by 23 email? 24 Α. Not me by email. He would 25 have -- he did not send anything but

Page 61

TERRENI

he -- Adam Kincaid, who I understand to be with the National Republican Redistricting Trust, I believe, had to send us the file. And he needed to transfer it by gmail or by Google Drive because it was a big file.

And he did it by sending it to Andy Fiffick at a gmail address.

- Q. Did you tell Oldham to send it to Mr. Fiffick?
- A. I didn't tell Oldham to send it to Mr. Fiffick. I think at some point during this conversation I believe he would have been in the room, we were looking for a gmail address that this individual could use and Andy probably volunteered his gmail address so that the file could be transferred.
- Q. So Oldham calls you and said he has some maps that he wants the Senate Judiciary to look at.

 Does he identify at that time that those maps would come from the

Page 62 1 TERRENI 2 National Republican Redistricting 3 Trust? Α. No. I don't think so. 4 Ι 5 mean I understood them to come from 6 some Republican entity but I wasn't 7 familiar with the National 8 Redistricting Trust per se. 9 Q. Did you tell him at that 10 time to send them to the Senate 11 redistricting email that had been 12 publicized to the rest of the 13 public? 14 I told him he could but he 15 wanted us to see them. We had 16 already published the staff plan and 17 he said, well, I'd like to send, 18 something to the effect, I don't 19 remember the exact conversation, 20 that he wanted us to see them and 21 wanted us to see them quickly so we 22 gave him that email address. 23 I want to look at what was 0. 24 submitted as tab 50 which is a text 25 exchange between Mr. Oldham and

	Page 63
1	TERRENI
2	another person from November 23,
3	2021, that said South Carolina
4	Senate 4343. And that would be
5	Plaintiffs' Exhibit 1.
6	(Plaintiffs' Exhibit 1, Text
7	exchange, marked for
8	identification, as of this date.)
9	A. I'm sorry, tab 50?
10	Q. Yes.
11	A. Okay. All right.
12	Q. You have that in front of
13	you?
14	A. I do.
15	Q. Is this do you recognize
16	this text exchange?
17	A. Yes.
18	Q. Is this one of the texts
19	that you received from Mr. Oldham?
20	A. Yes.
21	Q. So this 803-530-2893 number
22	is yours?
23	A. It is.
2 4	Q. Is this your personal cell
25	phone, a work cell phone, what is

Page 64 1 TERRENI 2 this? 3 It's both, my cell phone. Α. 4 And you used this cell Q. 5 phone for Senate redistricting 6 purposes, this cycle? 7 Among other things, yes. 8 Do you also receive emails 0. 9 around your other business with your law firm on this same cell phone? 10 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. So this is not a cell phone 13 designated just for the Senate, your 14 work with the Senate this 15 redistricting cycle? 16 Α. No, ma'am. 17 And this is one text Q. 18 exchange, some of it is redacted. 19 Is this the sum total of texts that 20 you had with Mr. Oldham? 21 About congressional Α. 22 redistricting or in general? 23 About congressional Q. 24 redistricting. 25 Α. Sorry, I'm just trying to

Page 65 1 TERRENI 2 look at it all. 3 I think so. Q. So looking at the November 4 5 19, 2021, 9:38 a.m. text, Dalton 6 Oldham reads -- sends a text to you 7 that says: "Call me. Want to know 8 if you/Andy has it." 9 Α. Um-hmm. 10 Do you know what he's 11 referring to here? I believe he's referring to 12 Α. 13 that plan -- he sent three plans at 14 one point and then he sent another 15 plan later on. I believe this would 16 refer to the first two plans that he 17 sent. 18 Okay. We are going to look Q. 19 at those because those were sent on 20 November 18th, I believe? 21 That would make sense. Α. 22 Around that time. 23 0. I'm sorry to interrupt you. 24 Α. No, I just said that makes 25 sense, around that time. I don't

Page 79 1 TERRENI 2 Q. Yes. 3 Yes, I have it. Α. 4 From Adam Kincaid to Andrew Q. Fiffick. 5 6 Α. Yes, ma'am. 7 So you've seen this before? Q. 8 Α. Yes. 9 0. Before even I sent it? 10 Α. Before you sent it, yes. 11 When did you see it? Q. 12 Α. I think in the process of 13 discovery. 14 Is this the two maps that 15 you believe Mr. Oldham was referring 16 to in the text exchange that we just 17 went over? 18 Α. I believe so, yes, ma'am. 19 And it's your position, 20 correct me if I'm wrong, that in 21 speaking to Mr. Oldham you told him 22 that he could communicate to NRRT, 23 that they could share these maps 24 with Mr. Fiffick at his gmail? 25 Object to form. MR. GORE:

Page 80 1 TERRENI 2 Α. Mr. Oldham or Mr. Kincaid, 3 whoever, needed an email address with which to share these maps. And 4 5 I believe, I don't specifically 6 recall, that we provided -- I 7 provided it to him probably. I just 8 know that Mr. Oldham called, he 9 wanted to share these maps with us, 10 we allowed him to do so. 11 Did you know Mr. Kincaid 12 before he sent these emails? 13 Α. No, ma'am. 14 Have you talked to 0. 15 Mr. Kincaid on the phone? 16 Α. No. 17 Q. Have you emailed separately 18 with Mr. Kincaid about congressional 19 redistricting? 20 Α. No. 21 So Mr. Oldham is the go-to Ο. 22 to NRRT as far as you are concerned? 23 No. Mr. Oldham -- I don't Α. 24 have a go-to to NRRT. 25 But Mr. Oldham is the Q.

	Page 81
1	TERRENI
2	connection between NRRT and the
3	Senate with regard to these maps?
4	A. Yeah.
5	MR. GORE: Objection.
6	Mischaracterizes his testimony.
7	You can answer.
8	A. Yeah.
9	Q. Can you read the subject of
10	this email, the one from
11	November 18, 2021, at 10:05 p.m.?
12	A. A and B.zip.
13	Q. Item shared with you A and
14	B.zip, is that accurate?
15	A. Yes, ma'am.
16	Q. And did you ultimately
17	review what was in the A and B.zip?
18	A. Yes.
19	Q. What was in there?
20	A. Two maps.
21	Q. Do you know if those maps
22	are referred to or have been
23	referred to as the Wren and Palmetto
2 4	maps?
25	A. I believe they have.

Page 82 1 TERRENI 2 Q. And do you know -- how did 3 you come to see them, can you 4 describe what you understand 5 happened once this Adam Kincaid sent 6 Mr. Fiffick this zip file, how did 7 it go from there to you seeing them? 8 One way or another the Α. 9 files were conveyed to Will Roberts 10 who loaded them in the Maptitude 11 software so that we could look at 12 them. 13 And by saying we looked at Q. 14 them, who was that? 15 Generally Mr. Roberts, me, 16 Mr. Fiffick, Breeden John may have 17 been there. I don't believe anybody 18 else specifically but... 19 Do you know if these maps 20 were shared with Jones Day? 21 I don't recall. I think Α. 22 so. 23 Did you share them with Q. 24 Jones Day? 25 I don't remember. Α.

Page 83

TERRENI

- Q. How would you have shared them with Jones Day? Via email?
- A. I don't think I would have shared them with Jones Day, it would have been -- I would have had Mr.

 Roberts or somebody send it to Jones Day, if we did it. I just don't remember this.
- Q. Why would you have sent them to Jones Day for what purpose?
- A. Because they were submitted to the Senate -- they were represented as having some political consensus behind them and so just for general informational purposes.
 - Q. Political consensus of who?
- A. The congressional delegation. Specifically the Republican congressional delegation. Mr. Oldham told me they had worked with the Republican congressional delegations on some maps or map delegation singular or rather he had said they worked on the delegations

Page 84

TERRENI

- -- with the delegation on maps. I asked him if the delegation included Mr. Clyburn. He said no, this is the Republican delegation and that was it. That's what he told me.
- Q. And by -- so that means that -- did you understand that to mean that Mr. Oldham had communicated with all six members of the congressional delegation but Representative Clyburn on this map or both of these maps?
- A. I understood Mr. Oldham to represent that the maps were acceptable to the six members of the delegation. We did not discuss whether he individually communicated with each member or whether he communicated with the staff or he didn't do a role call. Just what he said.
- Q. Are you aware of whether -- are you aware that there were other maps submitted by the public

Page 85 1 TERRENI 2 proposing congressional lines of 3 this cycle? Α. Yes. 4 5 Are you aware whether those 6 maps were submitted to Jones Day? 7 I imagine Jones Day was 8 made aware of various maps that were submitted. 9 I don't want to go in --10 I don't think it's appropriate, 11 unless my attorney tells me so, to 12 go through each map that I submitted 13 to Jones Day, but yes Jones Day was 14 generally made aware of maps that 15 were submitted to the Senate. 16 How many maps did you share 17 with Jones Day? 18 Α. I don't know how many maps 19 I individually shared with Jones Day 20 again -- I mean it could have been 21 anybody on Senate staff. I mean if 22 you are saying physically shared, 23 probably not many because Will 24 Roberts would have been the logical 25 person to do it. I'm speculating

Page 86 1 TERRENI 2 here. I just don't -- I mean are 3 you asking me you if we, collectively, the Senate staff 4 5 shared maps with Jones Day, yes. 6 The logistics of it, I'm sorry, I 7 don't remember. 8 How did you determine which Q. 9 maps you would have shared, you 10 collectively, the Senate, with Jones 11 Day? 12 Maps that I thought had Α. 13 some particular political 14 significance perhaps at a 15 constituency that would have made 16 them likely to adopt or the member 17 had some concerns about or had 18 questions about or was interested 19 If someone -- I mean that's a in. 20 general answer but it's pretty much 21 accurate. 22 Q. How would a nonpartisan 23 organization have factored into your 24 calculus of a map that had political 25 significance?

Page 87 1 TERRENI 2 Α. They certainly could have. 3 League of Women Voters was very active, well respected participant 4 5 in the process. I'm sure we paid 6 close attention to their maps. 7 Q. Do you recall specifically 8 sharing the League of Women Voters 9 map with Jones Day? 10 Again, I'm not trying to be 11 picky here but do I recall me 12 specifically sharing it, no. Did we 13 share it with Jones Day, probably 14 Jones Day also could have 15 accessed it from the website. 16 mean they are all posted. 17 Q. How many publicly submitted 18 maps are you aware were proposed by 19 the public that were posted on the 20 Senate's website? 21 I believe all of them. Α. 22 Q. Excuse me? 23 I believe all of them, at Α. 24 least the ones that were submitted 25 by the submission deadline.

Page 88

TERRENI

- Q. But how many were there, were there more than five, more than ten, more than 20? Do you have any sense of how many publicly submitted maps there were?
- A. It was more than five. May have been more than ten. I don't recall. We can look at the website and see.
- Q. But based upon your previous testimony is it your position that not you or the Senate staff collectively would not necessarily have shared each of those maps with Jones Day, you would have made some determination about which ones you would have selected to send to Jones Day, whether or not they looked at them separate -- all of them separately or not you made a selection of some not all of the maps to be submitted to Jones Day?

Mischaracterizes testimony. Go

MR. GORE:

Objection.

Page 89 1 TERRENI 2 ahead. You can answer. 3 Well, we did not share Α. every map with Jones Day. 4 That 5 obviously involved some editorial 6 function which we exercised in 7 sending maps to Jones Day. We did 8 not send every map to Jones Day. 9 0. The calculus for which maps 10 you would send to Jones Day was 11 essentially whether or not you 12 thought, you collectively thought 13 that a map had some political 14 significance, was likely to be 15 adopted or a member would be 16 interested in, those were the 17 contours of how you determine which 18 maps you would pick and potentially 19 submit to Jones Day? 20 Those would be some of the Α. 21 reasons, yes, for sending maps to 22 Jones Day, yes. 23 Looking at tab 58, and I 0. 24 sent you 57, 58 is the associated

stats for the Wren map.

25

I think we

Page 90 1 TERRENI 2 added it to that share point file. 3 Do you see a number 58 in that file? No, ma'am. I had to 4 Α. 5 download those exhibits so if you 6 added it afterward, you sent them to 7 For whatever reason I don't 8 have it. 9 MS. ADEN: John, could you 10 screen share it, 58. MR. GORE: I'm not sure I have 11 12 it either. I'm checking to see if 13 I have it, but I'm not certain that 14 I do. 15 It also should be -- have Q. 16 uploaded in Veritext. 17 MR. GORE: If Andrew or John 18 Cusick has it and can share it, 19 that might be a little easier. 20 MS. ADEN: Yeah. It's South 21 Carolina 26635, that's the Bates 22 stamp number. John, you can let me 23 know if you have it. 24 I'm about MR. CUSICK: Yup. 25 to pull it up in one second. Oh,

	Page 91
1	TERRENI
2	unfortunately maybe we can go
3	off record for a moment just
4	because the host disabled
5	participant screen sharing.
6	MS. ADEN: Mr. Gore, do you
7	need a minute to talk with your
8	client about this?
9	MR. GORE: Yeah. Let's take a
10	minute.
11	(Whereupon, there is a recess
12	in the proceedings.)
13	(Plaintiffs' Exhibit 3, Wren
14	plan, Bates South Carolina Senate
15	26635, marked for identification,
16	as of this date.)
17	Q. So you have had a chance to
18	look at South Carolina Senate 26635,
19	tab 58. This is identified in the
20	top left-hand corner as the Wren
21	plan.
22	Have you seen this document
23	before?
2 4	A. I don't remember.
25	Q. Looking at this document

Page 92 1 TERRENI 2 would this have been something 3 prepared by the South Carolina Senate during the redistricting 4 5 process or does this look like a 6 document prepared by someone outside 7 of the Senate? It likely was prepared by 8 Α. 9 the Senate. It was definitely 10 prepared by somebody with Maptitude. 11 We used Maptitude. And so I assume 12 it's a Senate document. 13 Were population summaries Q. 14 like these something you regularly saw during consideration of 15 16 congressional plans? 17 Α. Among others, yes. 18 And this summary includes Q. 19 information about total population; 20 is that correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. And deviations from 23 equality amongst the seven 24 congressional districts in total 25 numbers and even percentages; is

Page 93 1 TERRENI 2 that correct? 3 Yes, ma'am. Α. And does it also report 4 Q. 5 racial demographic information? 6 Α. It does. 7 Okay. I want to focus on Q. 8 the percentage of non-DoJ black Hispanic people identified in this 9 10 chart, which is the far right 11 column. 12 Are you familiar with the 13 category non-Hispanic DoJ black? 14 Α. Generally, yes. 15 Q. What do you understand it 16 to mean? 17 Α. What I understand it to 18 mean is when we at the outset of the 19 process settled on a metric for a 20 percentage of black population for 21 redistricting we had to pick one of 22 the measures. And for consistency's 23 sake we tried to, as I recall, we 24 tried to replicate the measure that 25 was used by the Department of

Page 94 1 TERRENI 2 Justice in the 2010-cycle, which 3 would have been non-Hispanic DoJ black. 4 5 Do you understand that 6 category to include people who 7 self-identify as black on the census 8 but do not identify as Hispanic in addition? 9 Yes, ma'am. 10 Α. 11 Are you familiar with a 0. 12 category called any part black that 13 the census reports? 14 Α. I am. 15 Q. What do you understand 16 about that category? 17 If a respondent in that Α. 18 category identifies any part as 19 black they will be any part black, 20 meaning you could be Hispanic and 21 black and identify as -- and that 22 would be included in AP black. 23 0. I have not asked you, were 24 you born in South Carolina? 25 Α. No, ma'am.

	Page 95
1	TERRENI
2	Q. Where were you born?
3	A. In Italy.
4	Q. Did you live in Italy for
5	any period of time after you were
6	born?
7	A. Yes, ma'am.
8	Q. For how long?
9	A. I lived in Italy until I
10	was eight. I lived in Belgium for
11	another three years, moved to the
12	States when I was 11.
13	Q. Do you have dual
14	citizenship?
15	A. Yes, ma'am.
16	Q. And have you when you
17	moved to the States when you were
18	around 11 where did you move to?
19	A. Columbia.
20	Q. South Carolina?
21	A. Yes, ma'am.
22	Q. Have you lived in Columbia,
23	South Carolina since that time?
24	A. I have.
25	Q. In South Carolina would you

Page 96

TERRENI

say that you are familiar -- strike that.

Based upon having lived in South Carolina for the better part of your life and your professional experience would you expect the difference between the non-Hispanic DoJ black category and the any part black category in South Carolina to have wide disparities?

- A. No.
- Q. So you expect them to be similar in number in South Carolina?
 - A. Generally, yes.
- Q. Looking at this Wren plan this is one of the plans -- these are statistics for one of the plans, we don't have a map associated with this statistical summary, but this is one of the statistical summaries from one of the plans that Adam Kincaid sent to Andy Fiffick, is that fair to say?
 - A. Yeah.

Page 97 1 TERRENI 2 Q. Okay. Looking at the 3 summary how many of the seven 4 congressional districts reflected 5 within it have a non-Hispanic DoJ 6 black population that is above 7 50 percent? 8 Α. None. 9 0. What is the district that 10 has the highest percentage of 11 non-Hispanic DoJ black voters in 12 this Wren plan? 13 Α. District 6. 14 Is that the current Ο. 15 district represented by 16 Representative Clyburn? 17 Yes, ma'am. Α. 18 Q. And is he the only black 19 congressional representative in 20 South Carolina? 21 Yes, ma'am. Α. 22 Q. And in at least the past 23 two decades has he been the only 24 black congressional representative 25 in South Carolina?

Page 98 1 TERRENI 2 Α. I don't remember when 3 Senator Scott was elected to the Senate or was appointed to the 4 5 Senate by Congress whether that was 6 in the past two decades or not, but 7 other than Congressman Scott if he 8 would fall in that time period, yes. 9 Ο. And the federal Congress is 10 Representative Clyburn the only 11 black representative that has been 12 elected in at least the past two --13 strike that. Outside of CD 6 what is the --14 15 can you read the percentages of 16 black voters in each of the other districts, the approximate 17 18 percentages? So let's start with 19 CD 1, what is the percentage of 20 black voters? 21 Α. 18.04 percent. 22 Q. What about CD 2? 23 Α. 24.89. 24 Q. And CD 3? 25 18.18. Α.

	Page 99
1	TERRENI
2	Q. CD 4?
3	A. 18.54.
4	Q. CD 5?
5	A. 25.39.
6	Q. And CD 7?
7	A. 26.81.
8	Q. So is it fair to say in the
9	Wren plan the lowest BVAP population
10	is in CD 1?
11	A. Yes.
12	Q. And the highest is in CD 7
13	15 27 percent, is that fair to say?
14	A. No, it would be in
15	District 6.
16	Q. Oh, the second highest.
17	I'm sorry. The second highest
18	outside of CD 6 was that in CD 7 as
19	26 percent?
20	A. Yes, ma'am.
21	Q. Yes I think I cut you
22	off. Yes or no?
23	A. Oh, I'm sorry, yes.
24	Q. What else do you recall
25	about seeing the Wren plan? In

Page 100 1 TERRENI 2 particular, what was your reaction 3 to it when you saw this map? I didn't think it was 4 Α. 5 viable. We had already produced a 6 staff plan which I don't believe had 7 been posted to the website at that 8 point but we had already had a plan 9 that we were going to bring to the 10 subcommittee as a working start. 11 And I looked at both of those plans, 12 Wren, and maybe it was Palmetto, 13 very briefly and thought their 14 shapes were messy and were not an 15 improvement over this back plan. 16 Did you communicate that 17 feedback about the Wren or the Palmetto to Mr. Oldham? 18 19 Α. Yes. 20 Q. Over a phone call? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. Did you communicate that 23 feedback -- and did you ask him to 24 communicate that feedback to NRRT, 25 Mr. Kincaid in particular?

Page 101 1 TERRENI 2 Α. No. 3 0. Did you receive guidance from Jones Day about the Wren plan 4 5 before you communicated it back to Mr. Oldham? 6 I don't believe so. 7 Α. 8 Do you have any reason to Q. 9 dispute that in this map Sumter is 10 split, Sumter as a county is split? 11 Α. I don't know. 12 What about Orangeburg, do Q. 13 you recall whether Orangeburg was 14 split as a county in this Wren plan? 15 Α. If you showed me the map, I 16 could, but I don't know. I can't -from memory, no, I don't have any 17 recollection. 18 19 Do you have any 20 recollection of how Beaufort was 21 treated in this Wren plan? 22 Α. No. 23 0. And what about Charleston, 24 the County of Charleston, do you 25 have any recollection of how

Page 123

TERRENI

compliance with that process. That doesn't mean that other people might have walked in and said I'm thinking about a map, especially if it was something that was represented as being from a member of the congressional delegation. Did we want to see it? Sure. But I don't know because I wasn't present at that meeting, but Dalton Tresvant may have done the same thing for Congressman Clyburn, that wouldn't have been unusual in my experience in redistricting.

If we had somehow used these maps that is before as the basis for something we proposed to the South Carolina Senate for its consideration with the subcommittee, I believe we literally said, hey, we got this map, you know, it has congressional input and style. We didn't think it -- we didn't think it was useful. We didn't think it

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 124 1 TERRENI 2 was anything that was going to cause us to change anything so basically, 3 you know, we took the email, we 4 5 loaded the map, looked at it, put it 6 aside. I mean we were trying to 7 move on. 8 But you are making the Q. 9 decision about whether it was the 10 basis for anything that you did. 11 The public has no way to analyze 12 whether or not it was the basis for 13 anything that you've done because 14 they have never seen the Jessamine, 15 the Wren or the Palmetto map; is 16 that correct? 17 Α. Yeah. 18 Did you share the Jessamine Q. 19 map with Jones Day? 20 I don't recall. Α. 21 Ο. Are you aware of anyone who 22 shared the Jessamine map with Jones 23 Day? 24 I don't recall. Α. 25 Q. Did you direct anyone to

Page 125 1 TERRENI 2 share the Jessamine map with Jones 3 Day? 4 Again, I don't recall. Α. Ιt 5 wasn't that significant. It's very 6 possible I didn't bother. 7 Did you share the Jessamine Q. 8 map or direct anyone to share the 9 Jessamine map with any Senate 10 leadership? 11 I don't remember. I don't 12 think so. 13 Do you recall asking any 14 Senate staff to share the Jessamine 15 map with any Senate leadership? 16 Α. No, ma'am. 17 After receipt of the 18 Jessamine map did you speak with 19 Mr. Oldham again about the map? 20 I don't recall. I probably Α. 21 did. 22 Did you provide him 23 feedback on the Jessamine map like 24 you did with respect to the Palmetto 25 and Wren map?

Page 126 1 TERRENI 2 Α. Well, I probably said Dale, 3 I'm sorry, we are just going to move These were not detailed 4 on. 5 discussions. 6 Looking at tab 11, which is 7 now a third email between Adam Kincaid and Mr. Fiffick dated 8 November 28, 2021, with Bates stamp 9 10 numbering South Carolina Senate 3246. 11 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit 6, Email 12 13 between Adam Kincaid and 14 Mr. Fiffick, Bates South Carolina 15 Senate 3246, marked for identification, as of this date.) 16 17 Α. Okay. 18 Q. Do you have any 19 understanding of why Mr. Kincaid 20 sent Mr. Fiffick another email four 21 days later from November 24th with 22 the file labeled Jessamine map? 23 Α. No. 24 Did you recall looking at 25 the attachment in this November 28th